Mentoring - How to get it, and how to give it

Linda Baum, MD PhD
Lynn Gordon, MD PhD

Mentor

- An experienced and trusted advisor who has a direct interest in the development and education of a less experienced individual
MENTORING

Based on Greek myth:
- Odysseus leaves to fight the Trojan war... his friend Mentor is left behind to guide the journey of Telemachus, Odysseus' son, from youth to manhood.

Most critical function of the Mentor is to help mentee accomplish his/her 'Dream':
- A 'Dream' to succeed, accomplish, and leave a legacy.

Bauchner, Arch Dis Child 2002; 86:82

"Behind one door is tenure - behind the other is flipping burgers at McDonald's."

Copyright © 2003 David Farley, d-farley@biblio.org
Benefits of Having a Mentor

- Mentors are perceived by mentees as being important in career advancement and career satisfaction
  - But some studies suggest that women may have a more difficult time obtaining mentors

- Mentors may influence personal development, career guidance, career choice, and research productivity in papers and grants

Sambunjak JAMA 2006;296:1103-15

A good mentor - gender and ethnicity considerations

- 1302 junior faculty surveyed - 54% reported a mentor

- In this study there was no significant difference in prevalence and quality of mentoring
  - Between men and women faculty
  - Between majority and minority faculty

- The majority of women and minority faculty with mentors reported that it was not important to have a mentor of the same gender or minority group.

However...

- Men are 3x more likely than women to have positive relationships with a mentor
- 10 - 32% of mentees report that their mentor used their work to further the mentor’s career rather than the mentee’s career

Sambunjak, JAMA 2006;296:1103-15
Fried, JAMA 1996;276:898-905

Nature’s Guide for Mentors

- “For me there is a difference between a supervisor and a mentor. With the latter you find that you are not simply a student with a research project, but a student with a career in front that the mentor helps you start.”
- “First and foremost, M is incredibly passionate about science. She eats, sleeps, and breathes science. Her enthusiasm is absolutely infectious, and it creates a wonderful atmosphere in the laboratory.”
- “M without a doubt, sees all his interactions with people as lifelong. He keeps in touch with ex-students, postdocs and so on after they have moved on.”

Adrian L, Dennis C, Campbell P. Nature 2007;447:791
CAREER-ENHANCING FACTORS
OB/GYNS w/ FELLOWSHIP AWARDS, 1971-99

- **Mentor**: 40%
- Fellowship: 15%
- Research time: 13%
- No. of publications: 7%
- Resources: 7%
- Seed money: 5%
- University: 5%
- Grants: 5%
- Bridge funding: 3%


Formal Mentoring at UCLA

- Required by the Dean’s office, administered by departments
- Required to meet 2x/yr, with documentation
- Mentee’s responsibility to include documentation in dossier for merit reviews as Assistant Professor and promotion to Associate Professor
Components of Mentoring

- There is no ONE mentor who can help with everything
  - You deserve one or more great mentors during your career
- A great mentor-mentee relationship
  - Mutual respect and trust
  - Works well for both
  - Deserves reassessment over time
  - Evolves to fit different needs over time
  - Is not always perfect
  - Is not always predictable
  - May or may not be time limited

“I’m right there in the room, and no one even acknowledges me.”

© Cartoonbank.com
A Good Mentor

- Has experience, desire and time
  - Should have formal, scheduled meetings
  - Should be available for informal discussions
- Has the respect of others at the institution
- May be considered a role model in his/her area
- Possesses knowledge and experience that will help the mentee

A Good Mentor

- Listens and hears
- Fosters independence and self-sufficiency
- Considers work-life balance
- Provides regular feedback, often in writing
  - Helps identify areas for improvement
- Is creative and
- Holds mentee accountable
A Good Mentor

- Some mentors are life-long, some are phase-specific.
- In addition to Department mentor, should have other informal mentors.

Types of Mentors:
- Professional skills – Research and/or Clinical
- Academic Career – your department
- Life/Work Balance
SELECTING A MENTOR

First, know what you need...

- What does your chairman/division chief/department expect from you?
- How will you be judged?
  - Academic Productivity
  - Clinical Productivity
  - Educational Competence
  - University service
- What are your strengths and weaknesses?
- What are your most challenging issues?

SELECTING A MENTOR

Who:
- Immediate available faculty
- Faculty in other Division or Depts.
- Faculty at other Institutions (e.g., for academic career mentoring)
- Rarely, non-faculty individuals (older trainees, technicians, etc.)
- Gauge previous mentoring success ("track record")
- Comfort level
- Recognize that despite the best intentions a change in Mentor is sometimes needed
Where do you need help?

- Formally meet to discuss goals & expectations
  - What is your personal progress towards meeting requirements?
  - Assume responsibility for personal growth
  - Identify areas where you need guidance
  - Take initiative in establishing focused mentoring relationships

Types of mentors: Academic Career

- **Goal:** To develop the academic career of the mentee
  - Balancing life and work demands
  - Juggling different aspects of an academic career
  - Navigating academic politics
  - Managing major career decisions and transitions
  - Managing academic promotion

- **Skills:** Long-term experience, longevity (survival), and wisdom within academia
- **Relationship:** Formal or informal
- **Official mentor should ideally not be in line of service - conflict of interest!!**
Academic Career Meetings

- Meet at minimum twice a year (required)
- May need more frequent meetings
  - Teaching: Feedback on teaching skills
  - Recognition in field:
    - National committees
    - Regional, stage, national organizations
    - Journal editorials
    - Networking
    - Connections to other senior professionals
- University and Public Service
- Clinical Care: Patterns of referral
- Promotion: Periodically review progress

Types of Mentors: Research Mentor

- Scientific Reasoning and Implementation,
  - Identifying the field of study, the questions to be asked, and the research tools to be used
- Selling of Science
  - For example, presentation of the data
- Time Management
  - Ensuring blocked time, meeting timelines, and timely completion of projects
Research Mentor

- Networking
  - Including collaborations, job, and career

- Obtaining grant funding
  - identifying grantors/programs, formulating application, proof-reading, dealing with rejections and amendments

- Counseling regarding research career potential
  - providing honest and frank assessment of success/failure potential

Research/Science Meetings

- If in a mentored program, may meet monthly or more frequently
  - How to focus research ideas
  - Research techniques
  - Routine for generating manuscripts
  - Timeline for publication
  - Selecting appropriate journals for submissions
  - Reviewing manuscripts
  - Grant writing support
  - Encourage independence
Types of Mentors: Life/Work Balance Mentor

- **Goal**: Help mentee navigate life
  - Similar situation or experience
  - Can be frank and honest about their choices
  - Seems overall to be satisfied
- **Skills**: Good listener, can present pros and cons of various options
- **Relationship**: Informal
- May change over time

Building the Relationship

- Meet regularly - set aside time
- Clarify common interest, shared values, professional goals
- Set 1-year goals and re-examine periodically
- Listen actively
- Present your needs in an articulate way
- Ask for guidance and assistance when needed
- Be cautious of potential exploitation
You need more than one

- No one mentor can be everything

- Identify individual mentors based on their areas of strength

- Sometimes, you need a new mentor or you need to end a prior mentoring relationship

Evaluation Process

- Semi-annual evaluations:
  - Satisfaction with the relationship
  - Progress towards meeting objectives
  - Opportunities for development
  - Expectations, tools, guidance
  - Research, grants, publications
Evaluation Process

- Annual Evaluations:
  - Satisfaction with the relationship
  - Self assessment outcome measurements:
    - National meetings attended
    - Publications submitted
    - Invited Positions
    - Speaking Invitations
    - Grants attained

THREATS TO MENTORING

- Increasing clinical burden of faculty
- Increasing competitiveness of research environment
- Increasing burden of clinical teaching, e.g. medical students & residents
- Non-reimbursable activity
- Negative or absent mentoring experience creates a vicious cycle
  - ‘...if I succeeded without mentoring then they can...’
  - ‘...overcoming obstacles will strengthen them...’
  - ‘...weeds out the weak and unprepared...’
Responsibilities of the Mentee

- Knowledge about requirements for tenure/promotion/advancement
- Responsibility for personal growth
- Initiative, especially at beginning
- Desire to learn from selected mentor
- Respect for advice, time given by mentor
- Seriousness about the relationship
- Preparation for each meeting
- Feedback, even if none requested
- Receptiveness to performance feedback

Mentee’s responsibility:
Take initiative

- Hold the mentor accountable for
  - Time commitment
  - Reading manuscripts & grants in a timely fashion
  - Assisting in career decisions
- Take responsibility - be prepared for the meetings
- Be honest about your passion and commitment
- Clarify interests, values, professional goals
- Seek out and be willing to hear criticism
**Mentee’s responsibility**

- Set concrete goals and re-examine periodically
- Listen actively
- Present your needs in an articulate way
- Ask for guidance and assistance when needed
- Have more than one mentor in order to gain additional perspectives
- Be cautious of potential exploitation

**Mentee’s responsibility**

- The mentee is responsible for 90% of the effort that goes into the mentor/mentee relationship

- Successful mentees are proactive and exhibit good self-control, high self-monitoring skills, and emotional maturity. They are willing to take on new challenges and assume responsibilities.
“A life is not important except in the impact it has on other lives”

Jackie Robinson

Benefits of Being a Mentor

- Carry on the legacy
- Stimulate creativity
- Recognition as one that encourages and promotes others
- Extend network
- Enhance value to others
Now, go be a mentor…

- Formal and informal relationships with students, trainees and other junior faculty
- Extend networks
- Pass on what you have learned

As you progress in the academic system, volunteer for mentoring in your department and in the university

Thanks to

Ricardo Azziz
Christine Walsh
Mike Rodriguez
Linda Baum
David Porter
Roberta Nieberg
Stanley Korenman

Lynn Gordon
Gary Holland
Jon Braun
Debora Farber